

Remarks/Arguments

Claims 1-20 are pending in this application, and are rejected in the final Office Action of November 23, 2009. Claims 1, 4-5, 7-8, 11-12, 15-16 and 19-20 are amended herein to more particularly point out and distinctly claim the subject matter Applicants regard as the invention.

Re: Patentability of Claims 1-20

Claims 1-20 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. §103(a) as being unpatentable over Japanese Patent Publication No. 2003-132624 by Tsurui (hereinafter, "Tsurui") in view of U.S. Patent No. 5,895,124 issued to Tsuga et al. (hereinafter, "Tsuga"). Applicants respectfully traverse this rejection for at least the following reasons.

Independent claim 1, as amended herein, recites:

"A method, comprising steps of:
enabling a user to select a recording title stored on a digital storage medium in a first program chain for password protection, said first program chain being a single program chain according to DVD specifications;
receiving a password from said user for said selected recording title;
storing said password on said digital storage medium in said first program chain with said selected recording title; and
requiring said password to be input before playing back said selected recording title." (emphasis added)

As indicated above, amended independent claim 1 defines a method having a feature in which a selected recording title and a user-assigned password for protecting the selected recording title are stored together on a digital storage medium in a single program chain according to DVD specifications. The advantages of this feature are expressly recognized by Applicants in their specification as follows: "By storing the user-assigned password ... in the same PGC as the selected recording, the present invention advantageously ensures that the password protection function is both backward and forward compatible with older and future digital playback apparatuses, respectively" (see description of step 335 of FIG. 3). Independent claims 8 and 16 are

amended herein to recite subject matter similar to independent claim 1, albeit in different claim formats.

Applicants submit that neither Tsurui nor Tsuga, whether taken individually or in combination, discloses or suggests, *inter alia*, the aforementioned claim feature in which a selected recording title and a user-assigned password for protecting the selected recording title are stored together on a digital storage medium in a single program chain according to DVD specifications.

On page 3 of the final Office Action dated November 23, 2009 the Examiner ostensibly alleges that the aforementioned feature of independent claims 1, 8 and 16 is disclosed by paragraph [0051] of Tsurui. Applicants respectfully disagree for at least the following reasons. Paragraph [0051] of Tsurui states:

“In the recording medium and its recorder of Example 1, as mentioned above, when recording video audio data on the recording medium 101, the password corresponding to the video audio data is registered, the program for password examinations to which reproduction of the video audio data recorded only when the password was entered is permitted is generated, the reproduction control information based on the DVD-Video standard that embedded the program is generated, and the reproduction control information is recorded on the recording medium 101 with video audio data. Thus, since it is renewable only by those who know that password, this video audio data stored in this recording medium 101 can perform viewing limitation certainly.” (emphasis added)

As indicated above, paragraph [0051] of Tsurui states that “video audio data” and its corresponding “password” are recorded on recording medium 101, but nowhere discloses or suggests that they are stored together in a single program chain according to DVD specifications, as claimed. In fact, paragraph [0051] of Tsurui never even discusses the concept of program chains.

Moreover, as will be explained hereinafter, Tsurui clearly teaches that the password for a given recording title is stored along with password input screen data,

and NOT in the same program chain as the protected recording title itself (as claimed). Here, Applicants first note that paragraphs [0042]-[0046] and Drawing 5(b) of Tsurui make a clear distinction between program chains PGC#1-PGC#5 which are used to store data for password input screens 301-305 of Drawing 3, and PGC#10 which is used to store the recording title protected by the password. Additionally, paragraph [0037] of Tsurui clarifies that the password for a given recording title is stored along with the password input screen data (i.e., in PGC#1-PGC#5), and not in the same program chain (i.e., PGC#10) as the protected recording title itself (as claimed). In particular, paragraph [0037] of Tsurui, in relevant part, states:

“The reproduction control information generation part 106 generates PGC for collation (Program Chain) (referred to as <<PGC for collation>>) using the 1st password and the video audio signal (***an image is 301-305 of drawing 3***) that is programmed for collation and it shows to password input.” (emphasis added)

As indicated above, paragraph [0037] of Tsurui clearly indicates that a user-assigned password for a given recording (i.e., the “1st password” above) is stored with “the video audio signal” that represents the images (i.e., password input screens) of Drawing 3. That is, reading paragraphs [0037] and [0042]-[0046] and Drawings 3 and 5(b) of Tsurui together, it is clear that Tsurui actually stores a password for a given recording with password input screen data (i.e., in program chains PGC#1-PGC#5 of Drawing 5(b)), and NOT in the same program chain (i.e., PGC#10 of Drawing 5(b)) as the recording title protected by the password (as claimed).

Applicants further note that the Examiner has previously interpreted (broadly) the multiple program chains shown by Tsurui as a single program chain. In response, Applicants note that amended independent claims 1, 8 and 16 now preclude such a broad interpretation by expressly stating that “said first program chain” (which stores both the selected recording title and its user-assigned password) is “a **single** program chain according to DVD specifications” (emphasis added).

Accordingly, for at least the foregoing reasons, Applicants submit that Tsurui fails to disclose or suggest at least one notable feature of the claimed invention, and thereby teaches a different solution for providing password protection than the claimed invention. Tsuga is unable to remedy this deficiency of Tsurui. Therefore, in view of Tsurui and Tsuga's failure to disclose or suggest each and every feature of independent claims 1, 8 and 16, these independent claims and their respective dependent claims are deemed non-obvious over the proposed combination of Tsurui and Tsuga, and withdrawal of the rejection is respectfully requested.

Conclusion

In view of the foregoing remarks/arguments and accompanying amendments, the Applicants believe this application stands in condition for allowance. Accordingly, reconsideration and allowance are respectfully solicited. If, however, the Examiner is of the opinion that such action cannot be taken, the Examiner is invited to contact the Applicants' attorney at (609) 734-6813, so that a mutually convenient date and time for a telephonic interview may be scheduled.

Respectfully submitted,

By: /Reitseng Lin/
Reitseng Lin
Reg. No. 42,804
Phone (609) 734-6813

Patent Operations
Thomson Licensing LLC
P.O. Box 5312
Princeton, New Jersey 08540
February 24, 2010